

We want a quorum of men to witness and publicize this sign

VOL #23  
KISLEV 5784



## 7 Minyan At a Bris

The Shulchan Aruch in סימן רס"ה סע' ו' says the following:

היכא דאפשר עבדינן למילה בעשרה והיכא דלא אפשר עבדינן בפרות מעשרה:

"When it is possible, the circumcision should be done among 10 individuals, and when it is not possible, it can be done among less than ten."

### Explanation:

#### I. Testimony and Publicizing

The Maharil (Hilchos Milah) writes that there should be ten people at a *bris milah* because ten people are necessary to "testify" that the father is performing this wonderful *mitzvah* of performing a *bris milah* on his son. This is based on the Pirkei D'Rabbi Eliezer (19), which writes that all "testimony" that Hashem gave the B'nei Yisrael should take place in front of ten men. Similarly, the Or Zarua (Milah 107) and the Rikanti (cited by the Radal on the Pirkei D'Rabbi Eliezer) rule that there should be ten people at a *bris milah* for the same reason.

A similar reason is given by the Darchei Moshe (Yoreh Dei'ah 265:1) in the name of Rav Tzemach Gaon. He suggests that ten people are necessary to publicize this amazing *mitzvah* that the father is performing. The *sefer* Bris Avraham HaKohen (p. 253) cites the Ri HaGozer who takes it one step further: that since a *bris milah* is called an "os" – a sign – we want a quorum of men to witness and publicize this sign.

The *sefer* D'rushim L'Chol Cheftzeihem (p. 203) adds that this reason fits nicely with the *pasuk* concerning Avraham Avinu that states "betzem ha'yom ha'zeh" – that Avraham performed the *bris milah* in the middle of the day so that everyone could witness this amazing *mitzvah*. Similarly, he cites the Aruch HaShulchan who connects the requirement of ten men at a *bris milah* to the requirement of ten men at a wedding, as both are meant to publicize the *mitzvah*.

#### II. Escaping Jail

A second reason is given by the Darchei Moshe (ibid) in the name of the Hagahos Alfasi. We compare the birth of this child to a prisoner leaving jail. Just as a prisoner must *bentch Gomer* in front of ten men, so, too, the *bris milah* should take place in front of ten men, as the baby "escaped" the dangers of his mother's womb.

#### III. Ramifications Between These Reasons

The Avnei Derech (11:148) suggests an unbelievable ramification between these reasons: whether a person may participate in a *bris milah* of a child who was conceived through an *aveirah* or improper relationship. According to the first

reason, to publicize the *mitzvah* of the parent, one should not attend a *bris milah* of a child who was the result of an *aveirah*, because we do not want to publicize the *aveirah*. However, according to the second reason, of *bentching Gomer*, one should attend the *bris milah*, as it helps the innocent child fulfill his obligation to thank Hashem in front of ten people.

Perhaps another ramification is whether the child counts towards the ten men. According to the first reason, to publicize the *mitzvah*, the child likely does not count to the quorum, and ten additional, *bar-mitzvah*-aged men are required. However, according to the second reason, of *bentching Gomer*, perhaps the child counts towards the *minyan*. Indeed, the *sefer* Os Shalom writes that since the whole point of ten men (according to this reason) is to enable a one-day-old baby to *bentch Gomer*, an obligation that is certainly not incumbent upon him, he should also count as part of the ten, as obviously age is not a factor.

Perhaps another ramification is whether one should push off a *bris milah* until after midday of the eighth day in order to perform the *milah* with a *minyan*. This is a big dispute among the *poskim*. See P'sakim UT'shuvos (Yoreh Dei'ah 262:3). According to the first reason, there would be no reason to push off the *milah* just for a *hiddur* of publicizing the *mitzvah*. However, according to the second reason, of *bentching Gomer*, perhaps there is room to push off the *mitzvah* past midday for this special *bentching of Gomer*.

#### IV. Practical Halachah

The Shulchan Aruch (Yoreh Dei'ah 265:5) rules that one should try to have ten men at his son's *bris milah*, but if this cannot be done, the *bris milah* should take place regardless.

#### V. Additional Notes

The Yaavetz (cited in the *sefer* Yaldei Kodesh, p. 180) gives a completely different reason for the requirement of ten men at a *bris milah*. He writes that ten men are needed for a practical reason: Each one performs a part of the *bris milah*, whether it is the *brachos*, being *sandek*, the *mohel*, etc.

The Avnei Yashfeh (4:102) writes that one who is performing *hatafas dam* *bris* on an older person need not have ten men witness this procedure.



ראש ישיבת חברון  
הרה"ג ר' דוד כהן שליט"א  
בברכות בברית

@sk your L.O.R / L.O.M

To Your1mohel@gmail.com X

@sk your L.O.R / L.O.M.

In our continued effort to raise awareness about the *mitzvah* of *bris mila*, we will raise questions and comments to promote discussions that pertain to the *inyan* of *mila*. Please feel free to discuss them with your LOR, or your LOM (Local Orthodox Mohel).

- 1 Why do some people recite יומים ליבשה, by a Bris?
- 2 If a Bris falls out on a fast day, who does NOT fast? Does it matter which fast it is?
- 3 If a Bris will be after Chatzos- is there an *inyan* of זריזין מקדימין? What about a Bris NOT on the 8th day?
- 4 Is a *bris* performed on Shabbos- הותרה או נ'מ'יה? What is the דהוייה?
- 5 Who is Hatafas Dam performed on?
- 6 How does Eliyahu travel to a *bris* on Shabbos?
- 7 Where is the עמרה?
- 8 Who Should be Sandek-A grandfather (His or Her's?) OR a Gadol Hador?

Send

Please submit any questions or comments you have, so they can be printed in future volumes of *Millim Brmila*, to Your1mohel@gmail.com.

# מעשה שהיה כך היה

## A "Rich" Sandek, Genuine Kindness

They were not religious and had no interest in arranging a Bris Milah

Someone came to honor Harav Dovid Feinstein Zatzal to serve as sandek at his son's bris, and he made a joke referencing the words of the Maharil that being sandek is a segulah for wealth.

Reb Dovid told him a story. Several years earlier, the yeshivah secretary told the Rosh Yeshivah that a certain Mrs. Klein had called the yeshivah office several times, looking for him. Reb Dovid returned the call.

She asked if he was David Feinstein, the son of Rabbi Moshe Feinstein, and he said that he was.

Mrs. Klein explained her sad situation. Her only daughter had given birth to a boy, but she and her son-in-law were not religious and had no interest in arranging a bris milah for the child. Mrs. Klein herself was religious, and when she protested, they told her that if she wanted to take care of the bris, they wouldn't object.

She would be making the bris in her home in Long Island, Mrs. Klein said, and she didn't have anyone to honor as sandek. She had heard about Rav Moshe Feinstein. He had passed away and his son had taken over the yeshivah. So she'd looked up the number in the phone book, and now she wanted to invite him to come serve as sandek at her grandson's bris.

Reb Dovid accepted, and on the designated day, he traveled to Long Island.

There was a small crowd on hand, and he didn't know any of the people there, but when Mrs. Klein asked him to stay for the seudah, he agreed. She asked him to share a few words, and again, he agreed. Then he wished the family well and returned to the Lower East Side.



It was a few years later, and one day he received a phone call from a lawyer.

Once Reb Dovid identified himself, the lawyer informed him that Mrs. Klein had passed away and had named him as a beneficiary in her will. She'd left \$100,000 to David Feinstein.

Reb Dovid looked at his visitor and completed the story. "I did not accept the money for myself, giving it to the yeshivah, but the point is, if the Maharil says that sandekaus is a segulah for ashirus, then it means precisely that, whether we see it or not. It's a reality."



Harav Dovid Feinstein Zatzal at a bris with World Famous Mohel R' Pesach Krohn Shlita

### "Genuine Kindness"

Here is a little but typical example of his approach to halacha and chessed. A Montreal family had a baby boy who was born without a digestive system. He required multiple surgeries and the parents consulted Reb Dovid constantly for halachic and medical guidance. At one point, after an unsuccessful surgery, the doctors said that he had only a short time to live and he should be allowed to die. The parents called Rav Dovid, who insisted that life does not belong to doctors and they must do everything

possible for the infant. The child lived for another nine years. At the age of six months, the doctors said it was safe to perform a Bris Milah. The parents learned that Reb Dovid was in the Laurentian Mountains, an hour away from Montreal on a three-day vacation. They informed Rav Dovid about the bris and even asked him to be sandek. Rav Dovid happily agreed. The parents were astounded. The Rosh Yeshivah would interrupt a brief vacation and take a long trip to be sandak for people he hardly knew! And the Hashgachah had placed him near Montreal just at that time! Many years later, with their child gone for several years, the parents say that they are still inspired by the Rosh Yeshivah's kindness.

## What's in a Name? ויקרא שמו בישראל

### Kalonymus - קלוניםמוס

Someone approached מרן שר התורה הגר"ק זצוק"ל with the name קלוניםמוס asking what Passuk should he say at the end of Shem-oneh Esray (there is NO passuk that begins with ק' and ends with ס)? He answered he should say the passuk in Tehillim,

ג' ה' "קולי אל ה' - אקרא ויענני מהר קדשו סלה"

ביצה דף כד: ד"ה ולערב, Rashi in,

רבינו קלוניםמוס איש רומי וכתב הטיב ניטין שפירושו שקולו ודיבורו הוא נימוס עיי"ש

### Kayla - קיילא

They asked מרן שר התורה הגר"ק זצוק"ל about this name and he replied that there is such a name in Yiddish. In the בית שמואל it is brought as קילא.

The Stiepler Zatzal suggested to someone who was called קיילא, that she could be called גיילא as ג' and ק' are interchangeable letters.

**\*NEW\* LISTEN TO MILLIM BMILA ON THE KAV BRIS**

02-621-4767 **1 2 3 4** PRESS 3 FOR ENGLISH MENU

Your Mohel, R' Azi Deutsch

your1mohel@gmail.com . 052-765-9459

Pediatrician Approved